

PY4607

TOLERATION IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD

Course Organiser: **Dr Adam Etnison (ae45)**

Office Hour: Tuesdays 5pm-6pm, or by appointment.

Co-Lecturer: **Dr Alexander Douglas (axd)**

Office Hour: Thursdays 2pm-3pm

Lecture: Tuesday 3 – 5pm, Edgecliffe G03

Seminars: Thursday 12 – 1pm, 1 – 2pm, Edgecliffe G01

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This module offers an in-depth study of the theory and practice of religious toleration in the Early Modern Period (16th & 17th centuries). The module covers classic texts, such as Locke's Letter Concerning Toleration, but also spends a good deal of time exploring the thought of lesser-known figures: Pierre Bayle, Sebastian Castellio, Jean Bodin, etc. The main purpose of the course is to try to understand the variety of arguments offered both for and against religious tolerance in the Early Modern Period, the historical background or context informing these arguments, and the relationship between these arguments and the actual practice of religious tolerance or intolerance.

LEARNING OUTCOMES

By the end of the module, students should have gained a solid understanding of the main arguments offered for and against religious toleration in the Early Modern period. Students will be able to analyse and critically evaluate these arguments, and will have learned how to understand them in their historical context. They will gain exposure to both historical sources and contemporary philosophical literature. The main requirements of the module are: Attendance at all classes; a careful reading of the assigned readings, allowing time to critically reflect on the arguments; preparation for both lectures and seminars; participation in tutorial discussions; and completion of all formal assessment.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS

Assessment: Continuous assessment (100%):

Tutorial Presentation (15%):

Deadline: **TBD** in consultation with instructors.

Task: The presentations should guide us through the reading. They should give an overview of the texts and alert us to problems and possible answers that may not be immediately obvious. Each presentation should last for about **10-15** minutes and should take into account the recommended reading. The presentation should be accompanied by a handout (of a maximum of two pages), which must be uploaded to MMS. Presenters should be able to answer some questions from their peers after the presentation.

Evaluation Criteria: Clarity of presentation (40%); Critical engagement (40%); Delivery (20%).

Note: In tutorial sessions in general, *all* students will be expected to come to class prepared with questions: not just that week's presenter(s).

Short Essay (30%):

Word Limit: a maximum of **2250** words.

Deadline: **Monday, April 2nd**.

Criteria: See undergraduate student handbook. Generally, research papers will be assessed on the basis of (i) lucidity, (ii) effort, (iii) relevance to the chosen question, (iv) independence of thought, (v) argumentative charity; and (vi) comprehension of the relevant readings.

Note: Students are encouraged to speak with the instructors about their choice of topic and essay plans in advance.

Final Essay (55%):

Word Limit: a maximum of **4250** words.

Deadline: **Monday, May 14th**.

RECOMMENDED TEXTS

- Benjamin Kaplan, *Divided By Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007).
- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003)

SYLLABUS

Week 1: Historical Perspectives

Required Reading:

- Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007). Introduction, pp. 1-14.
- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), Ch. 1, "Religious Toleration: The Historical Problem", pp. 1-14.

Supplementary Reading:

- Keith Thomas, *Religion and the Decline of Magic: Studies in Popular Beliefs in Sixteenth and Seventeenth-Century England* (London: Penguin Books, 1971), “Prologue,” pp. 3-27.
- Jonathan Israel, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity* (OUP, 2001), Introduction, pp. 1-23.
- Charles Taylor, *A Secular Age* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), “Introduction” (pp. 1-25), & “The Bulwarks of Belief” (pp. 25-90).

Week 2: Against Toleration – St. Augustine

Required Reading:

- Saint Augustine, “Letter 93” in *The Works of Saint Augustine: Part II – Letters, Volume I: Letters 1-99* (New York: New City Press, 2001), trans. Roland S.J. Teske, ed. John E. Rotelle, pp. 376-409.
- Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), Ch. 1, “A Holy Zeal,” pp. 15-48.

Supplementary Reading:

- Keith Thomas, *Religion and the Decline of Magic: Studies in Popular Beliefs in Sixteenth and Seventeenth-Century England* (London: Penguin Books, 1971), “The Magic of the Medieval Church,” pp. 27-58.
- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), Ch. 2, “The Christian Theory of Religious Persecution”, pp. 14-46.

Week 3: Toleration and Sovereignty: Jean Bodin

Required Reading:

- Jean Bodin, *Six Books of a Commonweale*, tr. Richard Knolles (London: G. Bishop, 1606) pp. 535-42
(<https://archive.org/stream/sixbookesofcommo00bodi#page/534/mode/2up>)
- Marion Leathers Kuntz’s Introduction to: Jean Bodin, *Colloquium of the Seven About Secrets of the Sublime* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975), pp. xix – xlvi).

Supplementary Reading:

- Marion Leathers Kuntz’s Introduction to: Jean Bodin, *Colloquium of the Seven About Secrets of the Sublime* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975), pp. xix – xlvi.
- Stephen Holmes, “Jean Bodin: The Paradox of Sovereignty and the Privatisation of Religion”, *Nomos* (30) 1988.

Week 4: Sebastian Castellio

Required Reading:

- Sebastian Castelli, “Advice to a Desolate France”, in *Journal of Markets and Morality*, 1 (19) 2016, pp.173-218
(<http://www.marketsandmorality.com/index.php/mandm/article/download/1149/1002>)

Supplementary Reading:

- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), Ch. 4, “The First Champion of Religious Toleration: Sebastian Castelli”, pp. 93-145.
- Edwin Curley, “Sebastian Castelli’s Erasmian Liberalism” in *Philosophical Topics* (2003), Vol. 31, No. 1/2, pp. 47-73.

Week 5: Toleration and Scepticism: Montaigne

Required Reading:

- Michel de Montaigne, “Apology for Raymond Sebond” (http://www.sophia-project.org/uploads/1/3/9/5/13955288/montaigne_sebond.pdf)

Supplementary Reading:

- E.M. Curley, “Skepticism and Toleration: The Case of Montaigne” in *Oxford Studies in Early Modern Philosophy*, Vol. 2, ed. Daniel Garber (OUP, 2005), pp. 1-35. (online draft: <https://www.colorado.edu/neh2015/sites/default/files/attached-files/curley.montaigneforosemp.pdf>)
- *Scepticism and Irreligion in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries* (Brill, 1993), Introduction (pp. 1-12) and Ch. 2 (pp. 31-45)

Week 6: Guest lecture by Mara van der Lugt on Bayle

Required Reading: TBA

Week 7: Hobbes

Required Reading:

- Hobbes, *Leviathan* (Hackett, 1994), Chs. 13, 31, 32, 43, 47.

Supplementary Reading:

- Alan Ryan, “A More Tolerant Hobbes?” in *Justifying Toleration: Conceptual and Historical Perspectives* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), ed. Susan Mendus, pp. 37-61.
- Teresa Bejan, “Difference without Disagreement: Rethinking Hobbes on ‘Independency’ and Toleration” in *The Review of Politics* (2016), Vol. 78, No. 1, pp. 1-25.

- Arash Abizabeh, “Publicity, Privacy, and Religious Toleration in Hobbes’ *Leviathan*” in *Modern Intellectual History* (2013), Vol. 10, No. 2, pp. 261-291.

Week 8: Cavendish and Spinoza

Required Reading:

- Margaret Cavendish, “Divers Orations” in *Political Writings* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 166-8
- Benedict de Spinoza, *Theologico-Political Treatise* in *The Collected Works of Spinoza*, tr. Edwin Curley (Princeton UP, 2016), Chs. 19-20

Supplementary Reading:

- Hilda Smith, “Margaret Cavendish and the False Universal”, 95-110 in Jacqueline Broad and Karen Green (eds.), *Virtue, Liberty, and Toleration: Political Ideas of European Women, 1400-1800* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2007).
- Susan James, *Spinoza on Philosophy Religion and Politics* (OUP, 2012), Ch.12, pp. 290-320.
- Edwin Curley, “Castellio vs. Spinoza vs. on Religious Toleration”, *Proceedings of the Twentieth World Congress on Philosophy* (2000), pp. 89-110.

Week 9: Guest lecture by Teresa Bejan

- Teresa Bejan, *Mere Civility: Disagreement and the Limits of Toleration* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2017), Chs. 1 & 2, pp. 20-82.

Supplementary Reading:

- Teresa Bejan, *Mere Civility: Disagreement and the Limits of Toleration* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2017), “Conclusion”, pp. 144-167.
- Roger Williams, “Mr. Cotton’s Letter Lately Printed”, “Christenings Make Not Christians”, and “Bloudy Tenent of Persecution for Cause of Conscience” in *On Religious Liberty: Selections from the Works of Roger Williams* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2008), ed. James Calvin Davis, pp. 46-73, 85-167.

Week 10: Locke

Required Reading:

- John Locke, “A Letter Concerning Toleration” (<http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/locke-a-letter-concerning-toleration-and-other-writings>)
- Jonas Proast, “The Argument of the Letter Concerning Toleration, Briefly Considered and Answered” (available through library)

Supplementary Reading:

- Richard Vernon, “Introduction” in *On Toleration* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2010), ed. Richard Vernon, pp. viii-xxxiii.
- Jeremy Waldron, “Locke, Toleration, and the Rationality of Persecution” in *Justifying Toleration*, pp. 61-87.
- Teresa Bejan, “Evangelical Toleration”, *The Journal of Politics*, 77 (4), 2015.

Week 11: Debating Toleration: Shaftesbury and Astell

Required Reading:

- Anthony Ashley Cooper, Third Earl of Shaftesbury, *A Letter Concerning Enthusiasm* (http://jaffro.net/letter_concerning_enthusiasm.pdf)
- Mary Astell, *An Enquiry After Wit* (London: John Batemen, 1722), pp.130-52 (available through library).

Supplmenetary Reading:

- Michal Michaelson, “ ‘Our Religion and Liberties’: Mary Astell’s Christian Political Polemics”, 123-36 in Jacqueline Broad and Karen Green (eds.), *Virtue, Liberty, and Toleration: Political Ideas of European Women, 1400-1800* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2007).
- David P. Alvarez, “Reason and Religious Tolerance: Mary Astell's Critique of Shaftesbury”, *Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 44 (4), 2011.