

PY4653

TOLERATION IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD

Course Organiser: **Dr Adam Etnson (ae45)**

Office Hour: TBD, or by appointment.

Co-Lecturer: **Dr Alexander Douglas (axd)**

Office Hour: TBD, or by appointment

Lecture: TBD

Seminars: TBD

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This module offers an in-depth study of the theory and practice of religious toleration in the Early Modern Period (16th & 17th centuries). The module covers classic texts, such as Locke's Letter Concerning Toleration, but also spends a good deal of time exploring the thought of lesser-known figures in this area: Mary Astell, Pierre Bayle, Jean Bodin, Bartolomé de Las Casas, Sebastian Castellio, Margaret Cavendish, Confucius, Lady Montagu, Roger Williams, etc. The main purpose of the course is to try to understand the variety of arguments offered both for and against religious tolerance in the Early Modern Period, the historical background or context informing these arguments, and the relationship between these arguments and the actual practice of religious tolerance or intolerance.

LEARNING OUTCOMES

By the end of the module, students should have gained a solid understanding of the main arguments offered for and against religious toleration in the Early Modern period. Students will be able to analyse and critically evaluate these arguments, and will have

learned how to understand them in their historical context. They will gain exposure to both historical sources and contemporary philosophical literature. The main requirements of the module are: Attendance at all classes; a careful reading of the assigned readings, allowing time to critically reflect on the arguments; preparation for both lectures and seminars; participation in tutorial discussions; and completion of all formal assessment.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS

Assessment: Continuous assessment (100%):

Tutorial Presentation (15%):

Deadline: TBD in consultation with instructors.

Task: The presentations should guide us through the reading. They should give an overview of the texts and alert us to problems and possible answers that may not be immediately obvious. Each presentation should last for about **10-15** minutes and should take into account the recommended reading. The presentation should be accompanied by a handout (of a maximum of two pages), which must be uploaded to MMS. Presenters should be able to answer some questions from their peers after the presentation.

Evaluation Criteria: Clarity of presentation (40%); Critical engagement (40%); Delivery (20%).

Note: In tutorial sessions in general, *all* students will be expected to come to class prepared with questions: not just that week's presenter(s).

Interpretation Criticism (30%):

Word Limit: a maximum of **1500** words.

Deadline: **Monday, April 5th (Week 9)**

Task: For this exercise, you are asked to find something in the assigned reading where a scholar ascribes a view to a historical philosopher on what you think to be insufficient evidence. You'll be marked primarily on your ability to find a genuinely

contentious interpretation in a scholarly work – an interpretation of a piece of text that could mean something else than what the interpreter claims.

Essay Plan (Ungraded)

Word Limit: a maximum of 750 words.

Deadline: Monday, April 26th (Week 12)

Task: In preparation for the final essay, you must submit an *essay plan* no later than three weeks before the essay is due. This will not be marked, but you are required to submit it in order to receive a mark on your essay. This should include your topic, a plan for how the essay will go, and some readings you'll use.

Final Essay (55%):

Word Limit: a maximum of 3500 words.

Deadline: Monday, May 17th (Week 15)

Task: The purpose of the final essay is for students to critically reflect on a key issue and/or author discussed in the course materials - or closely related thereto. Students are encouraged to speak with the instructors about their choice of topic and essay plans in advance.

Criteria: See undergraduate student handbook. Generally, research papers will be assessed on the basis of (i) lucidity, (ii) effort, (iii) relevance to the chosen question, (iv) independence of thought, (v) argumentative charity; and (vi) comprehension of the relevant readings.

RECOMMENDED TEXTS

- Benjamin Kaplan, *Divided By Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007).
- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003)

SYLLABUS

Week 1: Against Toleration – St. Augustine

Required Reading:

- Saint Augustine, “Letter 93” in Philip Schaff, ed., *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, First Series*, tr. J.G. Cunningham (Buffalo: Christian Literature Publishing Co., 1887), chs.1-7. [<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/1102093.htm>]
- Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), Ch. 1, “A Holy Zeal,” pp. 15-48.

Supplementary Reading:

- Keith Thomas, *Religion and the Decline of Magic: Studies in Popular Beliefs in Sixteenth and Seventeenth-Century England* (London: Penguin Books, 1971), “The Magic of the Medieval Church,” pp. 27-58.
- Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007). Introduction, pp. 1-14.
- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), Chs. 1-2, pp. 1-46.

Week 2: Toleration in the New World - Infidels & Heretics

Required Reading:

- Juan Ginés de Sepulveda, *Democrates Alter* (~1552, excerpt), from *Introduction to Contemporary Civilization in the West* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961) [<http://www.columbia.edu/acis/ets/CCREAD/sepulved.htm>]
- Bartolomé de Las Casas, *In Defense of the Indians* (~1552-3, Dekalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1992), tr. S Poole, “Summary of Sepulveda’s Position” & Chs. 1-5, 28 (*bis*), 38, 42, 49-50, pp. 11-6, 25-54, 190-5, 243-9, 267-74, 304-13.

Supplementary Reading:

- Michel de Montaigne, “On the Cannibals” [1580] in *The Complete Essays* (New York: Penguin, 1993), Ch. 31, pp. 228-241.
- Pope Alexander IV, *Papal Bull - Inter Caetera* (May 4th, 1493)
[<http://rvbeyondpublications.com/sitebuildercontent/sitebuilderfiles/bullintercaetera.pub.pdf>]
- Bartolomé de Las Casas, *A Short History of the Destruction of the Indies* (1552, New York: Penguin, 2004).
- Lewis Hanke, *All Mankind is One* (Dekalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1974), Ch. 3 “Analysis of Las Casas’s Treatise,” pp. 73-113.
- Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), Ch. 11, “Infidels,” pp. 294-333.

Week 3: Toleration and Sovereignty: Bodin & Castelleo

Required Reading:

- Jean Bodin, *Six Books of a Commonweale*, tr. Richard Knolles (London: G. Bishop, 1606) pp. 535-42
(<https://archive.org/stream/sixbookesofcommo00bodi#page/534/mode/2up>)
- Sebastian Castelleo, “Advice to a Desolate France”, in *Journal of Markets and Morality*, 1 (19) 2016, pp.173-218
(<http://www.marketsandmorality.com/index.php/mandm/article/download/1149/1002>)

Supplementary Reading:

- Marion Leathers Kuntz’s Introduction to: Jean Bodin, *Colloquium of the Seven About Secrets of the Sublime* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975), pp. xix – xlv.
- Stephen Holmes, “Jean Bodin: The Paradox of Sovereignty and the Privatisation of Religion”, *Nomos* (30) 1988.
- Perez Zagorin, *How The Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), Ch. 4, “The First Champion of Religious Toleration: Sebastian Castelleo”, pp. 93-145.

- Edwin Curley, “Sebastian Castellio’s Erasmian Liberalism” in *Philosophical Topics* (2003), Vol. 31, No. 1/2, pp. 47-73.
- Keith Thomas, *Religion and the Decline of Magic: Studies in Popular Beliefs in Sixteenth and Seventeenth-Century England* (London: Penguin Books, 1971), “Prologue,” pp. 3-27.
- Jonathan Israel, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity* (OUP, 2001), Introduction, pp. 1-23.

Week 4: Hobbes

Required Reading:

- Hobbes, *Leviathan* (Hackett, 1994), Chs. 13, 31, 32, 43, 47.

Supplementary Reading:

- Alan Ryan, “A More Tolerant Hobbes?” in *Justifying Toleration: Conceptual and Historical Perspectives* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), ed. Susan Mendus, pp. 37-61.
- Teresa Bejan, “Difference without Disagreement: Rethinking Hobbes on ‘Independency’ and Toleration” in *The Review of Politics* (2016), Vol. 78, No. 1, pp. 1-25.
- Arash Abizabeh, “Publicity, Privacy, and Religious Toleration in Hobbes’ *Leviathan*” in *Modern Intellectual History* (2013), Vol. 10, No. 2, pp. 261-291.

Week 5: Roger Williams (Guest lecture by Teresa Bejan)

Required Reading:

- Roger Williams, “Bloody Tenent of Persecution for Cause of Conscience” in *On Religious Liberty: Selections from the Works of Roger Williams* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2008), ed. James Calvin Davis, pp. 85-157.

Supplementary Reading:

- Roger Williams, “Christenings Make Not Christians” in *On Religious Liberty: Selections from the Works of Roger Williams* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2008), ed. James Calvin Davis, pp. 157-67.

- Teresa Bejan, *Mere Civility: Disagreement and the Limits of Toleration* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2017), esp. Ch. 2, pp. 50-81.
- Wendy Brown, “Tolerance as/in Civilizational Discourse” in *Regulating Aversion: Tolerance in an Age of Identity and Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, Ch. 7, pp. 176-207.
- Martha Nussbaum, *Liberty of Conscience: In Defense of America’s Tradition of Religious Liberty* (New York: Basic Books, 2010).
- Teresa Bejan, “Is Civility a Sham?” (TED Talk).

Week 6: Spinoza and Cavendish

Required Reading:

- Margaret Cavendish, “Divers Orations” in *Political Writings* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 166-8
- Benedict de Spinoza, *Theologico-Political Treatise* in *The Collected Works of Spinoza*, tr. Edwin Curley (Princeton UP, 2016), Chs.5 and 20.

Supplementary Reading:

- Hilda Smith, “Margaret Cavendish and the False Universal”, 95-110 in Jacqueline Broad and Karen Green (eds.), *Virtue, Liberty, and Toleration: Political Ideas of European Women, 1400-1800* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2007).
- Susan James, *Spinoza on Philosophy Religion and Politics* (OUP, 2012), Ch.12, pp. 290-320.
- Edwin Curley, “Castellio vs. Spinoza vs. on Religious Toleration”, *Proceedings of the Twentieth World Congress on Philosophy* (2000), pp. 89-110.

Week 7: Locke (Guest Lecture by James Harris)

Required Reading:

- John Locke, “A Letter Concerning Toleration” (<http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/locke-a-letter-concerning-toleration-and-other-writings>)
- Jonas Proast, “The Argument of the Letter Concerning Toleration, Briefly Considered and Answered” (available through library)

Supplementary Reading:

- Richard Vernon, "Introduction" in *On Toleration* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2010), ed. Richard Vernon, pp. viii-xxxiii.
- Jeremy Waldron, "Locke, Toleration, and the Rationality of Persecution" in *Justifying Toleration*, pp. 61-87.
- Teresa Bejan, "Evangelical Toleration", *The Journal of Politics*, 77 (4), 2015.

Week 8: Bayle (Guest lecture by Mara van der Lugt)

Required Reading:

- Pierre Bayle, *A Philosophical Commentary on These Words of the Gospel, Luke 14.23, 'Compel Them to Come In, That My House May Be Full'* [1686], Part 1, ch. 1, 2, 3; Part 2, Ch. 8, 9 [<http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/bayle-a-philosophical-commentary-on-these-words-of-the-gospel>] Note: This is an 18th-century translation; there is a modern translation by Tannenbaum (1987), but this is not available in St Andrews.

Supplementary Reading:

- Israel, Jonathan. *Enlightenment Contested: Philosophy, Modernity, and the Emancipation of Man, 1670-1752*. (Oxford 2006), Ch. 6, esp. section 2.
- Jenkinson, Sally. 'Two Concepts of Tolerance: Or Why Bayle Is Not Locke', *The Journal of Political Philosophy* 4, no. 4 (1996), 302-21.
- Kilcullen, John. 'Bayle on the Rights of Conscience', in *Sincerity and Truth: Essays on Arnauld, Bayle and Toleration* (Oxford 1988), 54-105.
- Mori, Gianluca. 'Pierre Bayle, the Rights of the Conscience, the "Remedy" of Toleration', *Ratio Juris* 10, no. 1 (Mar. 1997), 45-60.

Week 9: The Encounter with China

Required Reading:

- Confucius, *The Morals of Confucius, A Chinese Philosopher, 'Maxims'*, pp.115-43. [<https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.st->

andrews.ac.uk/docview/2240956324/fulltextPDF/565233074D684D6EPQ/1?acountid=8312]

- Simon Kow, *China in Early Enlightenment Political Thought* (Routledge, 2016), Ch.2. [<https://r2.vlereader.com/Reader?ean=9781315750125>]

Supplementary Reading:

- Jonathan Israel, *Enlightenment Contested* (Oxford: Oxford University Press,), Ch.25: 'Spinoza, Confucius, and Classical Chinese Philosophy' [<https://oxford-universitypressscholarship-com.ezproxy.st-andrews.ac.uk/view/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199279227.001.0001/acprof-9780199279227-chapter-25>]
- Yuen Ting Lai, 'The Linking of Spinoza to Chinese Thought by Bayle and Malebranche', *Journal of the History of Philosophy* (1985) Volume 23, Number 2 [<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/226870/pdf>]

Week 10: Debating Toleration: Shaftesbury and Astell

Required Reading:

- Anthony Ashley Cooper, Third Earl of Shaftesbury, *A Letter Concerning Enthusiasm* (http://jaffro.net/letter_concerning_enthusiasm.pdf)
- Mary Astell, *An Enquiry After Wit* (London: John Batemen, 1722), pp.130-52 (available through library).

Supplementary Reading:

- Michal Michaelson, " 'Our Religion and Liberties': Mary Astell's Christian Political Polemics", 123-36 in Jacqueline Broad and Karen Green (eds.), *Virtue, Liberty, and Toleration: Political Ideas of European Women, 1400-1800* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2007).
- David P. Alvarez, "Reason and Religious Tolerance: Mary Astell's Critique of Shaftesbury", *Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 44 (4), 2011.

Week 11: The Enlightenment

Required Reading:

- Voltaire, *Treatise on Tolerance*: the sections called ‘Abuses of Intolerance’, ‘The Only Cases in Which Intolerance is Humanly Lawful’, ‘Of Universal Toleration’, ‘Of Superstition’ [https://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/voltaire-toleration-and-other-essays#Voltaire_0029_165]
- Lady Mary Wortley Montagu, *Letters of the Right Honourable Lady M—y W—y M—e Written during Her Travels in Europe, Asia and Africa to Persons of Distinction, Men of Letters, &c. in Different Parts of Europe*, Letters 27 and 58 [<http://www.gutenberg.org/cache/epub/17520/pg17520-images.html>]

Supplementary Reading:

- Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), Ch. 12 ‘Enlightenment’, pp.333-360.
- Dorinda Outram, *The Enlightenment*, Ch.9: ‘The Rise of Modern Paganism? Religion and the Enlightenment’ [<https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/st-andrews/reader.action?docID=1099910&ppg=130>]